

# MUSICA DISCIPLINA

## A YEARBOOK OF THE HISTORY OF MUSIC

Edited by  
GILBERT REANEY†  
and  
PAUL L. RANZINI

VOLUME LIII, 2003–2008



American Institute of Musicology

## AMERICAN INSTITUTE OF MUSICOLOGY

The American Institute of Musicology publishes seven series of critical editions, scholarly studies, reference works, and this journal, all dedicated to the study of the music and culture of the Medieval, Renaissance, and early Baroque eras. The publications of the Institute are used by scholars and performers alike and constitute a major core collection of early music, theoretical writings on music, and the scholarly analysis of that music and its sources.

For information on establishing a standing order or subscription to this journal or any of our series, or for editorial guidelines on submitting proposals, please contact:

American Institute of Musicology  
800 736-0070 (U.S. book orders)  
608 836-9000 (phone)  
608 831-8200 (fax)  
<http://www.corpusmusicae.com>  
[orders@corpusmusicae.com](mailto:orders@corpusmusicae.com)  
[info@corpusmusicae.com](mailto:info@corpusmusicae.com)

© 2009 by the American Institute of Musicology, Verlag Corpusmusicae, GmbH. All rights reserved. No part of this journal may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher. Offprints of individual articles are available upon request.

ISSN 0077-2461 v. 53

Printed in the United States of America. ♻️ The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of the American National Standard for Information Sciences Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-1992.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Editorial Note</i> .....	4
Frank D'Accone, <i>In Memoriam Gilbert Reaney</i> .....	5
* * *	
Roland Jackson, <i>Guillaume de Machaut and Dissonance in Fourteenth Century French Music</i> .....	7
Nancy Van Deusen, <i>In and Out of a Latin "Forest": The Timaeus latinus, its Concept of Silva, and Music as a Discipline in the Middle Ages</i> .....	51
Nors S. Josephson, <i>Many Roads Lead to Rome: Multifarious Stylistic Tendencies and Their Musical Interrelationships Within the Ars Subtilior</i> .....	71
Oliver Huck, <i>The Music of the Angels in Fourteenth- and Early Fifteenth-century Music</i> .....	99
Galliano Ciliberti, <i>Protest music a Perugia nel xvi secolo: gli scritti musicali di Raffaello Sozi (1529–89)</i> .....	121
* * *	
<i>Directions to Contributors</i> .....	143

# GUILLAUME DE MACHAUT AND DISSONANCE IN FOURTEENTH CENTURY FRENCH MUSIC\*

ROLAND JACKSON

Some time ago Gilbert Reaney pointed to the artful and inventive nature of Machaut's dissonance treatment in two groundbreaking essays.<sup>1</sup> His observations remain the essential starting point for any further investigation of this topic. In the present paper, I will attempt to expand on Reaney's findings by establishing a context, i.e. by considering Machaut's dissonances in respect to those of his fourteenth-century French contemporaries. On the one hand, I will examine what he acquired from his predecessors (most notably Philippe de Vitry and the contributors to the *Mass of Tournai*), and on the other what he appears to have passed on to later composers (figures such as Anthonello and Philippus de Caserta, Matteo da Perugia, or Goscalcus). My procedure will be to set individual passages side-by-side, and to take into account their similar patterns of dissonance. In this way, I hope, we will be better able to ascertain the nature of Machaut's innovations and come to a fuller understanding of his genius, albeit in but a single aspect of his musical art.

## Dissonances in Individual Voices<sup>2</sup>

Machaut probably shows most directly the influence of Vitry in his adoption of certain rhythmic-melodic patterns typical of Vitry's motets. In Vitry's "Bona condit" (Ex. 1a), for instance, a B (*breve*) duration is divided into Ss (*semibreves*) and Ms (*minims*),<sup>3</sup> forming the characteristic pattern SMSM.<sup>4</sup>

---

\*In fond memory of Gilbert Reaney, Machaut scholar extraordinaire.

1. Gilbert Reaney, "Fourteenth Century Harmony and the Ballades, Rondeaux, and Virelais of Guillaume de Machaut," *Musica Disciplina* 7 (1953), 129–46; "Notes on the Harmonic Technique of Guillaume de Machaut," *Essays in Musicology: a Birthday Offering for Willi Apel*, ed. Hans Tischler (Bloomington, 1968), 63–68.

2. The designations for individual voices are as follows: in motets: tenor, triplum, *motetus*; in chansons: tenor, contratenor, *cantus*. Motets sometimes included a lower contratenor, chansons a higher *triplum*. Parts frequently left undesignated in the sources are italicized here.

3. Vitry's upper voices are often based on figures of a B duration, as is pointed out by Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, *Compositional Techniques in the Four-Part Isorhythmic Motets of Philippe de Vitry and His Contemporaries I* (New York, 1989), 46.

4. In this transcription and those that follow, I use a 4:1 reduction. S=quarter or dotted quarter note, M=an 8th note.

## IN AND OUT OF A LATIN “FOREST”: THE *TIMAEUS LATINUS*, ITS CONCEPT OF *SILVA*, AND MUSIC AS A DISCIPLINE IN THE MIDDLE AGES

NANCY VAN DEUSEN

The readers of the *Timaeus*, both in the Greek as well as in its Latin translation, are presented with what on reflection might be considered to be self-evident, namely that seeing is believing. According to the *Timaeus*, the sense of sight is the first sense, reinforcing repetition, thus reassuring the viewer with the pleasure of recognition and an accompanying sense of comfort.

Obvious as this might seem, it would also indicate that the sense of hearing, and in conjunction with that sense music, would take second place, serving a secondary function during the period of time during the Middle Ages when the *Timaeus* in its partial Latin translation, with lengthy commentary by Chalcidius, continued to be read and receive comment. There is much evidence that the *Timaeus*, in its Latin translation was important and influential in the Middle Ages, presenting an arsenal of conceptual tools with which to access and deal with basic principles regarding matter, generation, and life, and providing a vocabulary of Latin terms for approaching these basic concepts. The *Timaeus latinus* also served as a platform from which to begin further discussion concerning these issues and words, so ubiquitous was its influence.<sup>1</sup>

---

1. Raymond Klibansky, *The Continuity of the Platonic Tradition. Plato's Parmenides in the Middle Ages* (London, 1939, repr. 1982, 1984), 28, in discussing the translations of Plato's *Meno* and *Phaedo* in the mid-twelfth century writes: The importance of these works, however, cannot be compared with that of the *Timaeus*. “This dialogue, or rather its first part, was studied and quoted throughout the Middle Ages, and there was hardly a mediaeval library of any standing which had not a copy of Chalcidius' version and sometimes also a copy of the fragment translated by Cicero. Although these facts are well known, their significance for the history of ideas has perhaps not been sufficiently grasped by historians.” Klibansky's statement is even more true for an assessment of music writing within the discipline of music throughout the Middle Ages. It should be mentioned in this context that the copy that was believed to be the oldest extant manuscript of the *Timaeus latinus* was that of Hucbald of St. Armand, who also wrote at least one treatise on music, and even in the twelfth century continued to enjoy a reputation for having served as a consultant for the establishment of *scholae cantorum*—singing schools that were always attached to schools that also enjoyed reputations as centers of medieval learning, as, apparently, the cathedral school at Nevers in the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries. (See van Deusen, *Music at Nevers Cathedral: Principal Sources of Medieval Chant*, 2 vols. [Binningen, Switzerland, 1980], especially the introduction to volume 1). The link between the *Timaeus* and utterly basic music conceptualizations with attendant vocabulary has not, in view of its importance, come under investigation.

# MANY ROADS LEAD TO ROME: MULTIFARIOUS STYLISTIC TENDENCIES AND THEIR MUSICAL INTERRELATIONSHIPS WITHIN THE *ARS SUBTILIOR*

NORS S. JOSEPHSON

The late *Ars Nova* in France encompasses roughly the time-period, 1370–1410 and is sometimes labeled, *Ars Subtilior* due to the increasingly complex nature of its notational systems. It was centered in the southern French musical establishments of the Papal Court in Avignon, the Duke of Berry, and the Count of Foix, in addition to the royal Aragonese court in northern Spain and various northern Italian centers ca. 1410 (whose music is partly preserved in the Ms. Modena, Bibl. Est.  $\alpha$ . M. 5, 24). A later (ca. 1410's) and somewhat subsidiary source for this highly sophisticated and refined musical culture is also evident in the Cypriot repertory of the Ms. Torino, Bibl. Naz., J. II. 9.

This predominantly French repertory is especially known for its elaborate rhythmical structures, including examples of advanced isorhythm, displacements, syncopations, and multiple rhythmic layers. On closer examination, however, the *Ars Subtilior* also displays numerous concurrent musical styles, some of which may be traced back to the earlier *Ars Nova* of Philippe de Vitry and Guillaume de Machaut. Other, more progressive stylistic aspects include a resurgence of contrapuntal modality, a more refined kind of linear dissonance, and rhythmic drives to the final cadence. These latter forward-looking tendencies ultimately were to bear fruit in the High Renaissance of Ockeghem and Josquin Desprez a century later.

## A. Diatonic features in the *Ars Subtilior*

Many compositions in the central source of the *Ars Subtilior*—namely, the Chantilly, Musée Condé Ms. 564 (henceforth abbreviated, Ch)—are pervasively diatonic and may be readily analyzed in terms of hexachordal mutations. Convenient examples are found in the works of Matheus de Sancto Johanne (for example, *Je chante ung chant*; Ch, fol. 16 and *Sanz vous ne puis*; Ch, fol. 35), Guido (*Or voit tout*; Ch, fol. 25v), and above all Vaillant, whose five Ch compositions prefer C- and G-hexachordal outlines and frequent triadic pitch relationships around C–E–G (especially the isorhythmic rondeau, *Pour ce que*, Ch, fol. 26). These rather traditional compositional

# THE MUSIC OF THE ANGELS IN FOURTEENTH- AND EARLY FIFTEENTH-CENTURY MUSIC<sup>1</sup>

OLIVER HUCK

The idea, that angels sing, is an original contribution by the Christian Middle Ages to our concept of music. It was a constant factor during the Middle Ages whereas the ancient subdivision of music into *musica mundana*, *musica humana* and *musica instrumentalis*, summarised by Boethius, was the object of changing interpretations. In 1415 Nicolaus de Capua related the singing of the angels to the Classical classification of music by calling *musica mundana* now *musica angelica*, thus replacing the Greek concept of universal harmony with the Christian concept of angelic choirs.<sup>2</sup> The singing of the angels can be considered as the paradigm of the concept of music in the Middle Ages.<sup>3</sup>

---

1. An earlier version of this paper was read at the 10th International Symposium on Late Medieval and Early Renaissance Music in Novacella 2006; it merges two papers read at the Medieval and Renaissance music conferences at Glasgow (2004) and Cambridge (2006). This paper has benefited greatly from comments by Jeremy Llewellyn and Carlo Bosi, to whom I am most grateful.

2. See Nicolaus de Capua, "Compendium musicale," in *Adrien de la Fage: Essais de diphthérogaphie musicale* (Paris 1864), 311: "Quod sunt genera cantus?—Musica angelica, musica humana et musica instrumentalis. Musica angelica est illa quae ab angelis ante conspectum Dei semper administrat. Musica humana est illa quae ab humana voce profertur, et ab ista formatur cantus ecclesiasticus, vel cantus planus qui quotidie cantatur in ecclesia Dei et fuit compositus per beatissimum Gregorium papam. Musica instrumentalis est illa quae instrumentis musicalibus exercetur sicut in Psalmista continetur: Laudate Dominum in tympano et choro, in cordis et organo."

3. The singing of the angels and angelic music have been the subject of musicological scholarship in two different ways: on the one hand, Hammerstein as well as Rastall focus on iconography and theory of music in the Middle Ages, see Reinhold Hammerstein, *Die Musik der Engel* (Munich and Bern, 1962) and Richard Rastall, "Heaven. The Musical Repertory," in *The Iconography of Heaven*, ed. Clifford Davidson (Kalamazoo 1994), 162–96; on the other, studies on musical compositions including angelic singing as a subject are predominantly limited to a repertoire including works from the birth of Christ in Johann Sebastian Bach's *Weihnachtsoratorium* to the concert of the angels in Paul Hindemith's symphony *Mathis der Maler*. The only medieval piece of music cited by Kirsch in his short history of angelic singing is Kyrie VIII subtitled *De angelis*, and he only cites it because it often figured as a *cantus firmus* in later compositions see Wilfried Kirsch, "Der Gesang der Engel," *Musik und Kirche* 69 (1999):364–81. The Annunciation dialogue seems to be the exception from the rule see Anne Walters Robertson, "Remembering the Annunciation in Medieval Polyphony," *Speculum* 70 (1995):275–304.

## PROTEST MUSIC A PERUGIA NEL XVI SECOLO: GLI SCRITTI MUSICALI DI RAFFAELLO SOZI (1529–89)\*

GALLIANO CILIBERTI

Gli scritti musicali di Raffaello Sozi (Perugia, 1529–*ivi*, 11 maggio 1589)<sup>1</sup>—fondatore dell'Accademia degli Unisoni nel 1561<sup>2</sup> e già possessore del manoscritto Perugia, Biblioteca Comunale "Augusta," 431 (G 20)—sono contenuti in un *Libro di famiglia* oggi custodito nel fondo antico sempre della stessa Biblioteca con segnatura 322 (E 70).<sup>3</sup> Il codice di 198 carte misura cm.

---

\**In memoriam* Armen Carapetyan. Il presente lavoro è il frutto di un progetto più ampio sulle tecniche mecenatistiche nel Medioevo e nel Rinascimento a Roma nonché nello Stato Pontificio svolto nell'ambito di un assegno di ricerca assegnatomi anni fa dall'Università degli Studi di Pavia (Scuola di Paleografia e Filologia Musicale di Cremona), responsabile il compianto amico, maestro prof. Albert Dunning.

1. Su Raffaello Sozi: ERMINIA IRACE, *La nobiltà bifronte. Identità e coscienza aristocratica a Perugia tra XVI e XVII secolo*, Milano, Unicopli, 1995, pp. 105, 129, 136–38, 153, 163–64, 167–69 e GALLIANO CILIBERTI, *Struttura e provenienza del manoscritto Perugia, Biblioteca Comunale 431 (G 20): nuovi contributi*, in *La musica e il sacro*, Atti dell'Incontro Internazionale di Studi, Perugia 29 settembre–1 ottobre 1994, a cura di Biancamaria Brumana e Galliano Ciliberti, Firenze, Olschki, 1997, pp. 21–63.

2. Sull'Accademia degli Unisoni si veggano gli studi di ALLAN. W. ATLAS, *The «Accademia degli Unisoni»: A Music Academy in Renaissance Perugia*, in *A Musical Offering: Essays in Honor of Martin Bernstein*, a cura di Edward H. Clinkscale e Claire Brook, New York, Pendragon Press, 1977, pp. 1–30; MICHELANGELO PASCALE, *Vincenzo Cossa e l'ambiente musicale perugino tra Cinquecento e Seicento*, in *Arte e Musica in Umbria tra Cinquecento e Seicento*, Atti del XII Convegno di Studi Umbri, Gubbio-Gualdo Tadino, 30 novembre–2 dicembre 1979, a cura di Biancamaria Brumana e Francesco Federico Mancini, Perugia, Facoltà di Lettere e Filosofia dell'Università degli Studi di Perugia, 1981, pp. 159–99; ERMINIA IRACE, *Le accademie letterarie nella società Perugina tra Cinquecento e Seicento*, «Bollettino della Deputazione di Storia Patria per l'Umbria» 86, 1990, pp. 155–78. Per nuovi ulteriori documenti: BIANCAMARIA BRUMANA, *Per una storia dell'oratorio musicale a Perugia nei secoli XVII e XVIII*, «Esercizi. Arte Musica Spettacolo» 3, 1980, pp. 97–107; BIANCAMARIA BRUMANA, *Iconografia della S. Cecilia ed accademie musicali: nuovi contributi*, in *Musica e immagine. Tra iconografia e mondo dell'opera. Studi in onore di Massimo Bogianckino*, a cura di Biancamaria Brumana e Galliano Ciliberti, Firenze, Olschki, 1993, pp. 115–36; GALLIANO CILIBERTI, *Musica e società in Umbria tra medioevo e rinascimento*, Turnhout, Brepols, 1998, pp. 203–35.

3. Sul codice: ERMINIA IRACE, *Su «la scrittura dei libri di famiglia»: il caso di Raffaello Sozi da Perugia*, in *Alfabetismo e cultura scritta. Seminario permanente. Notizie, marzo 1986*, a cura di Attilio Bartoli Langeli, Perugia, Dipartimento di Scienze Storiche dell'Università di Perugia, 1986, pp. 16–21; ERMINIA IRACE, *Memoria familiare e identità sociale nel Cinquecento. Il libro di famiglia dei Sozi (Perugia, Biblioteca Comunale Augusta, ms. E 70)*, Tesi di Laurea (relatore prof. Vincenzo Nicolini†), Università degli Studi di Perugia, Facoltà di Lettere e Filosofia, Corso di Laurea in Lettere, Anno Accademico 1987–1988, ed anche ERMINIA IRACE, *Geografia e storia dei libri di famiglia: Perugia*, «Schede Umanistiche», nuova serie 2, 1992, pp. 71–93.